

State Administration & Veterans' Affairs Interim Committee

November 17, 2015

Committee Authority – CoPP Rules

No Requirement for Committee Action

- If the Committee does not act (does not renew its former objection or take further action, the CoPP may adopt the rules.

Other

- Request or have prepared an economic impact statement regarding a proposed rule (2-4-405, MCA).
- Require statement to be published that SAVA believes the rule is “adjective or interpretive and therefore advisory only”. 2-4-308, MCA.
- Require material adopted by reference to be printed in full if not copyrighted. *See* 2-4-307, MCA.
- Request and obtain agency’s rulemaking records for reviewing compliance with 2-4-305, MCA.
- Submit oral or written comments to agency rulemaking record (2-4-402, MCA).
- Review “incidence and conduct” of proceedings under MAPA (2-4-402, MCA)
- Recommend amendment, rejection, or repeal of rule (2-4-402, 2-4-411, and 2-4-412, MCA).
- Request and obtain agency rulemaking record for review (2-4-402, MCA)
- Hold hearings and conduct investigations involving agency compliance with MAPA and other statutes (5-11-107, MCA)
- Bring or participate in litigation involving MAPA (2-4-402, MCA)

Objections

▪ **Objection to Delay Adoption of Rules**

- Majority of members of Committee object to chair regarding proposed rules in order to delay adoption of the rule by an agency (2-4-305(9), MCA).
 - This objection must be renewed each time the Committee meets or it expires.
 - This objection may be renewed until the publication of the last issue of the register that is published before expiration of the 6-month period during which the adoption notice must be published (the Agency has the ability to adopt the rules in the Montana Administrative Register in the last publication at the end of the 6 month period, irrespective of the renewal of the objection).
- Note: “A rule is adopted on the date that the adoption notice is filed with the secretary of state” 2-4-306(1), MCA.

Committee Authority – CoPP Rules

Objections Cont.

■ **Objection to Delay Effective Date**

- If “the committee meets and under 2-4-406(1) objects” to a proposed rule, the proposed rule is “not effective until the day after final adjournment of the regular session” of the Legislature. Section 2-4-306(4)(c), MCA.
- This has been traditionally interpreted to be a majority of members voting on the motion.
- This objection requires a written “**concise statement of the committee’s reasons for its action.**” The reasons should specify why the Committee believes the rules was not adopted “**in substantial compliance**” with 2-4-302 [notice and publication requirements], 2-4-303 [concerns temporary and emergency rules], or 2-4-305 [full consideration of public comment, statement of reasons, consideration of sponsor’s comments, citation to rulemaking authority and implemented sections, consistency with statute, reasonably necessary to effectuate statute].” Section 2-4-406, MCA.
- Committee’s objection may be withdrawn later (including after the Agency adopts a rule that has changes that, in a majority of Committee members’ opinions make it comply with the objection and concerns)
- Note: “Each rule is effective after publication in the register” 2-4-306(4), MCA.
- Procedure:
 - Committee objects with “concise statement of its reasons for its action”.
 - Within 14 days after the Committee’s notification to the Agency, the Agency must respond in writing.
 - The Committee may choose to withdraw or modify its objection to the rules. If it does not, “it may vote to send the objection to the secretary of state, who shall, upon receipt of the objection, publish the objection in the register adjacent to any notice of adoption of the rule and in the ARM adjacent to the rule, provided an agency response must also be published if requested by the agency. Costs of publication of the objection and the agency response must be paid by the committee.” 2-4-406(3).

- Outcome: The agency bears the burden in a legal challenge of proving that the rule objected to was adopted in substantial compliance with 2-4-302, 2-4-303, and 2-4-305.

Committee Authority – CoPP Rules

Poll

Requirements:

- Can be initiated by the Committee (discretionary) or by more than 20 legislators objecting to the proposed rules (mandatory). Section 2-4-403, MCA
- “The poll must include an opportunity for the agency to present a written justification for the proposed rule to the members of the legislature.” Section 2-4-403, MCA.

Outcome:

- “If the appropriate administrative rule review committee has conducted a poll . . . the results of the poll must be admissible in any court proceeding involving the validity of the proposed rule . . . or . . . the adopted rule If the poll determines that a **majority of the members of both houses** find that the proposed rule or adopted rule is contrary to the intent of the legislature, the proposed rule or adopted rule must be conclusively presumed to be contrary to the legislative intent in any court proceeding involving its validity.” Section 2-4-403, MCA.

Publication

- “If the appropriate administrative rule review committee has conducted a poll of the legislature in accordance with 2-4-403, the results of the poll must be published **with the rule if the rule is adopted by the agency.**” Section 2-4-306, MCA
 - Statute does not require that a poll delay the agency’s ability to adopt the rule during poll administration. However, the statute does not provide any clarity about how a poll’s results must be published. This is important because if the Secretary of State determines a rule must be published concurrently with the adoption notice in the Montana Administrative Register rather than publishing it with a reprint of the adoption notice or simply by placing the results in the Administrative Rules of Montana, it might delay the publication (and hence effective date) of the rule.

Montana Public Employees' Retirement System

11 New Rules Concerning Deferred Retirement Option Plan for members of the Highway Patrol Officers' Retirement System (HPORS) as provided by Ch. 258, L. 2015.

Ch. 258, L. 2015, sec. 5:

...

(2) **Each month** during the DROP period, in addition to the contributions credited under subsection (1)(b), a participant's DROP account must be credited with:

- (a) the monthly benefit that would have been payable to the participant had the participant terminated employment and retired at the commencement of the DROP period, excluding any postretirement benefit adjustments that would have been applied to the benefit under part 7 of this chapter; and
- (b) interest every fiscal yearend at the actuarially assumed rate of return. Proportionate interest must be credited for distributions taking place at other than a fiscal yearend.

Ch. 258, L. 2015, sec. 6:

- (3) The benefit paid pursuant to this section must include interest credited to the participant's account every fiscal yearend at the actuarially assumed rate of return. Proportionate interest must be credited for distributions taking place at a time other than a fiscal yearend.

Rule: "Monthly DROP Accrual" does not include the statutory reference to monthly credits for the "interest every fiscal yearend."

- This interpretation is consistent with Ch. 258, L. 2015, sec. 6 but not with the directive that "[e]ach month during the DROP period [each] account must be credited with . . . interest every fiscal yearend" in sec. 5.

Selected MAPA Statutes

2-4-302. Notice, hearing, and submission of views. (1) (a) Prior to the adoption, amendment, or repeal of any rule, the agency shall give written notice of its proposed action. The proposal notice must include a statement of either the terms or substance of the intended action or a description of the subjects and issues involved, the reasonable necessity for the proposed action, and the time when, place where, and manner in which interested persons may present their views on the proposed action. The reasonable necessity must be written in plain, easily understood language.

(b) The agency shall state in the proposal notice the date on which and the manner in which contact was made with the primary sponsor as required in subsection (2)(d). If the notification to the primary sponsor was given by mail, the date stated in the proposal notice must be the date on which the notification was mailed by the agency. If the proposal notice fails to state the date on which and the manner in which the primary sponsor was contacted, the filing of the proposal notice under subsection (2)(a)(i) is ineffective for the purposes of this part and for the purposes of the law that the agency cites in the proposal notice as the authority for the proposed action.

(c) If the agency proposes to adopt, increase, or decrease a monetary amount that a person shall pay or will receive, such as a fee, cost, or benefit, the notice must include an estimate, if known, of:

- (i) the cumulative amount for all persons of the proposed increase, decrease, or new amount; and
- (ii) the number of persons affected.

(2) (a) (i) The proposal notice must be filed with the secretary of state for publication in the register, as provided in 2-4-312. Except as provided in subsection (2)(a)(ii), within 3 days of publication, a copy of the published proposal notice must be sent to interested persons who have made timely requests to the agency to be informed of its rulemaking proceedings, and to the office of any professional, trade, or industrial society or organization or member of those entities who has filed a request with the appropriate administrative rule review committee when the request has been forwarded to the agency as provided in subsection (2)(b).

(ii) In lieu of sending a copy of the published proposal notice to an interested person who has requested the notice, the agency may, with the consent of that person, send that person an electronic notification that the proposal notice is available on the agency's website and an electronic link to the part of the agency's website or a description of the means of locating that part of the agency's website where the notice is available.

(iii) Each agency shall create and maintain a list of interested persons and the subject or subjects in which each person on the list is interested. A person who submits a written comment or attends a hearing in regard to proposed agency action under this part must be informed of the list by the agency. An agency complies with this subsection if it includes in the proposal notice an advisement explaining how persons may be placed on the list of interested persons and if it complies with subsection (7).

(b) The appropriate administrative rule review committee shall forward a list of all organizations or persons who have submitted a request to be informed of agency actions to the agencies that the committee oversees that publish rulemaking notices in the register. The list must be amended by the agency upon request of any person requesting to be added to or deleted from the list.

(c) The proposal notice required by subsection (1) must be published at least 30 days in advance of the agency's proposed action. The agency shall post the proposal notice on a state electronic access system or other electronic communications system available to the public.

(d) (i) When an agency begins to work on the substantive content and the wording of a proposal notice for a rule that initially implements legislation, the agency shall contact, as provided in subsection (8), the legislator who was the primary sponsor of the legislation to:

- (A) obtain the legislator's comments;
- (B) inform the legislator of the known dates by which each step of the rulemaking process must be completed; and

(C) provide the legislator with information about the time periods during which the legislator may comment on the proposed rules, including the opportunity to provide comment to the appropriate administrative rule review committee.

(ii) If the legislation affected more than one program, the primary sponsor must be contacted pursuant to this subsection (2)(d) each time that a rule is being proposed to initially implement the legislation for a program.

(iii) Within 3 days after a proposal notice covered under subsection (2)(d)(i) has been published as required in subsection (2)(a)(i), a copy of the published notice must be sent to the primary sponsor contacted under this subsection (2)(d).

(3) If a statute provides for a method of publication different from that provided in subsection (2), the affected agency shall comply with the statute in addition to the requirements contained in this section. However, the notice period may not be less than 30 days or more than 6 months.

(4) Prior to the adoption, amendment, or repeal of any rule, the agency shall afford interested persons at least 20 days' notice of a hearing and at least 28 days from the day of the original notice to submit data, views, or arguments, orally or in writing. If an amended or supplemental notice is filed, additional time may be allowed for oral or written submissions. In the case of substantive rules, the notice of proposed rulemaking must state that opportunity for oral hearing must be granted if requested by either 10% or 25, whichever is less, of the persons who will be directly affected by the proposed rule, by a governmental subdivision or agency, by the appropriate administrative rule review committee, or by an association having not less than 25 members who will be directly affected. If the proposed rulemaking involves matters of significant interest to the public, the agency shall schedule an oral hearing.

(5) An agency may continue a hearing date for cause. In the discretion of the agency, contested case procedures need not be followed in hearings held pursuant to this section. If a hearing is otherwise required by statute, nothing in this section alters that requirement.

(6) If an agency fails to publish a notice of adoption within the time required by 2-4-305(7) and the agency again proposes the same rule for adoption, amendment, or repeal, the proposal must be considered a new proposal for purposes of compliance with this chapter.

(7) At the commencement of a hearing on the intended action, the person designated by the agency to preside at the hearing shall:

(a) read aloud the "Notice of Function of Administrative Rule Review Committee" appearing in the register; and

(b) inform the persons at the hearing of the provisions of subsection (2)(a) and provide them an opportunity to place their names on the list.

(8) (a) For purposes of contacting primary sponsors under subsection (2)(d), a current or former legislator who wishes to receive notice shall keep the current or former legislator's name, address, e-mail address, and telephone number on file with the secretary of state. The secretary of state may also use legislator contact information provided by the legislative services division for the purposes of the register. The secretary of state shall update the contact information whenever the secretary of state receives corrected information from the legislator or the legislative services division. An agency proposing rules shall consult the register when providing sponsor contact.

(b) An agency has complied with the primary bill sponsor contact requirements of this section when the agency has attempted to reach the primary bill sponsor at the legislator's address, e-mail address, and telephone number on file with the secretary of state pursuant to subsection (8)(a). If the agency is able to contact the primary sponsor by using less than all of these three methods of contact, the other methods need not be used.

2-4-303. Emergency or temporary rules. (1) (a) If an agency finds that an imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare requires adoption of a rule upon fewer than 30 days' notice and states in writing its reasons for that finding, it may proceed upon special notice filed with the committee, without prior notice or hearing or upon any abbreviated notice and hearing that it finds practicable, to adopt an emergency rule. The rule may be effective for a period not longer than 120 days, after which a new

emergency rule with the same or substantially the same text may not be adopted, but the adoption of an identical rule under 2-4-302 is not precluded. Because the exercise of emergency rulemaking power precludes the people's constitutional right to prior notice and participation in the operations of their government, it constitutes the exercise of extraordinary power requiring extraordinary safeguards against abuse. An emergency rule may be adopted only in circumstances that truly and clearly constitute an existing imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare that cannot be averted or remedied by any other administrative act. The sufficiency of the reasons for a finding of imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare is subject to judicial review upon petition by any person. The matter must be set for hearing at the earliest possible time and takes precedence over all other matters except older matters of the same character. The sufficiency of the reasons justifying a finding of imminent peril and the necessity for emergency rulemaking must be compelling and, as written in the rule adoption notice, must stand on their own merits for purposes of judicial review. The dissemination of emergency rules required by 2-4-306 must be strictly observed and liberally accomplished.

(b) An emergency rule may not be used to implement an administrative budget reduction.

(2) A statute enacted or amended to be effective prior to October 1 of the year of enactment or amendment may be implemented by a temporary administrative rule, adopted before October 1 of that year, upon any abbreviated notice or hearing that the agency finds practicable, but the rule may not be filed with the secretary of state until at least 30 days have passed since publication of the notice of proposal to adopt the rule. The temporary rule is effective until October 1 of the year of adoption. The adoption of an identical rule under 2-4-302 is not precluded during the period that the temporary rule is effective.

2-4-305. Requisites for validity -- authority and statement of reasons. (1) (a) The agency shall fully consider written and oral submissions respecting the proposed rule, including comments submitted by the primary sponsor of the legislation prior to the drafting of the substantive content and wording of a proposed rule that initially implements legislation.

(b) (i) Upon adoption of a rule, an agency shall issue a concise statement of the principal reasons for and against its adoption, incorporating in the statement the reasons for overruling the considerations urged against its adoption. If substantial differences exist between the rule as proposed and as adopted and the differences have not been described or set forth in the adopted rule as that rule is published in the register, the differences must be described in the statement of reasons for and against agency action. When written or oral submissions have not been received, an agency may omit the statement of reasons.

(ii) If an adopted rule that initially implements legislation does not reflect the comments submitted by the primary sponsor, the agency shall provide a statement explaining why the sponsor's comments were not incorporated into the adopted rule.

(2) Rules may not unnecessarily repeat statutory language. Whenever it is necessary to refer to statutory language in order to convey the meaning of a rule interpreting the language, the reference must clearly indicate the portion of the language that is statutory and the portion that is an amplification of the language.

(3) Each proposed and adopted rule must include a citation to the specific grant of rulemaking authority pursuant to which the rule or any part of the rule is adopted. In addition, each proposed and adopted rule must include a citation to the specific section or sections in the Montana Code Annotated that the rule purports to implement. A substantive rule may not be proposed or adopted unless:

(a) a statute granting the agency authority to adopt rules clearly and specifically lists the subject matter of the rule as a subject upon which the agency shall or may adopt rules; or

(b) the rule implements and relates to a subject matter or an agency function that is clearly and specifically included in a statute to which the grant of rulemaking authority extends.

(4) Each rule that is proposed and adopted by an agency and that implements a policy of a governing board or commission must include a citation to and description of the policy implemented. Each agency rule implementing a policy and the policy itself must be based on legal authority and otherwise comply with the requisites for validity of rules established by this chapter.

(5) To be effective, each substantive rule adopted must be within the scope of authority conferred and in accordance with standards prescribed by other provisions of law.

(6) Whenever by the express or implied terms of any statute a state agency has authority to adopt rules to implement, interpret, make specific, or otherwise carry out the provisions of the statute, an adoption, amendment, or repeal of a rule is not valid or effective unless it is:

(a) consistent and not in conflict with the statute; and

(b) reasonably necessary to effectuate the purpose of the statute. A statute mandating that the agency adopt rules establishes the necessity for rules but does not, standing alone, constitute reasonable necessity for a rule. The agency shall also address the reasonableness component of the reasonable necessity requirement by, as indicated in 2-4-302(1) and subsection (1) of this section, stating the principal reasons and the rationale for its intended action and for the particular approach that it takes in complying with the mandate to adopt rules. Subject to the provisions of subsection (8), reasonable necessity must be clearly and thoroughly demonstrated for each adoption, amendment, or repeal of a rule in the agency's notice of proposed rulemaking and in the written and oral data, views, comments, or testimony submitted by the public or the agency and considered by the agency. A statement that merely explains what the rule provides is not a statement of the reasonable necessity for the rule.

(7) A rule is not valid unless notice of it is given and it is adopted in substantial compliance with 2-4-302, 2-4-303, or 2-4-306 and this section and unless notice of adoption of the rule is published within 6 months of the publishing of notice of the proposed rule. The measure of whether an agency has adopted a rule in substantial compliance with 2-4-302, 2-4-303, or 2-4-306 and this section is not whether the agency has provided notice of the proposed rule, standing alone, but rather must be based on an analysis of the agency's substantial compliance with 2-4-302, 2-4-303, or 2-4-306 and this section. If an amended or supplemental notice of either proposed or final rulemaking, or both, is published concerning the same rule, the 6-month limit must be determined with reference to the latest notice in all cases.

(8) (a) An agency may use an amended proposal notice or the adoption notice to correct deficiencies in citations of authority for rules and in citations of sections implemented by rules.

(b) An agency may use an amended proposal notice but, except for clerical corrections, may not use the adoption notice to correct deficiencies in a statement of reasonable necessity.

(c) If an agency uses an amended proposal notice to amend a statement of reasonable necessity for reasons other than for corrections in citations of authority, in citations of sections being implemented, or of a clerical nature, the agency shall allow additional time for oral or written comments from the same interested persons who were notified of the original proposal notice, including from a primary sponsor, if primary sponsor notification was required under 2-4-302, and from any other person who offered comments or appeared at a hearing already held on the proposed rule.

(9) If a majority of the members of the appropriate administrative rule review committee notify the committee presiding officer that those members object to a notice of proposed rulemaking, the committee shall notify the agency in writing that the committee objects to the proposal notice and will address the objections at the next committee meeting. Following notice by the committee to the agency, the proposal notice may not be adopted until publication of the last issue of the register that is published before expiration of the 6-month period during which the adoption notice must be published, unless prior to that time, the committee meets and does not make the same objection. A copy of the committee's notification to the agency must be included in the committee's records.

2-4-306. Filing and format -- adoption and effective dates -- dissemination of emergency rules. (1)

Each agency shall file with the secretary of state a copy of each rule adopted by it or a reference to the rule as contained in the proposal notice. A rule is adopted on the date that the adoption notice is filed with the secretary of state and is effective on the date referred to in subsection (4), except that if the secretary of state requests corrections to the adoption notice, the rule is adopted on the date that the revised notice is filed with the secretary of state.

(2) Pursuant to 2-15-401, the secretary of state may prescribe rules to effectively administer this chapter, including rules regarding the printed or electronic format, style, and arrangement for notices and

rules that are filed pursuant to this chapter, and may refuse to accept the filing of any notice or rule that is not in compliance with this chapter and the secretary of state's rules. The secretary of state shall keep and maintain a permanent register of all notices and rules filed, including superseded and repealed rules, that must be open to public inspection and shall provide copies of any notice or rule upon request of any person. Unless otherwise provided by statute, the secretary of state may require the payment of the cost of providing copies.

(3) If the appropriate administrative rule review committee has conducted a poll of the legislature in accordance with 2-4-403, the results of the poll must be published with the rule if the rule is adopted by the agency.

(4) Each rule is effective after publication in the register, as provided in 2-4-312, except that:

(a) if a later date is required by statute or specified in the rule, the later date is the effective date;

(b) subject to applicable constitutional or statutory provisions:

(i) a temporary rule is effective immediately upon filing with the secretary of state or at a stated date following publication in the register; and

(ii) an emergency rule is effective at a stated date following publication in the register or immediately upon filing with the secretary of state if the agency finds that this effective date is necessary because of imminent peril to the public health, safety, or welfare. The agency's finding and a brief statement of reasons for the finding must be filed with the rule. The agency shall, in addition to the required publication in the register, take appropriate and extraordinary measures to make emergency rules known to each person who may be affected by them.

(c) if, following written administrative rule review committee notification to an agency under 2-4-305(9), the committee meets and under 2-4-406(1) objects to all or some portion of a proposed rule before the proposed rule is adopted, the proposed rule or portion of the proposed rule objected to is not effective until the day after final adjournment of the regular session of the legislature that begins after the notice proposing the rule was published by the secretary of state, unless, following the committee's objection under 2-4-406(1):

(i) the committee withdraws its objection under 2-4-406 before the proposed rule is adopted; or

(ii) the rule or portion of a rule objected to is adopted with changes that in the opinion of a majority of the committee members, as communicated in writing to the committee presiding officer and staff, make it comply with the committee's objection and concerns.

(5) An agency may not enforce, implement, or otherwise treat as effective a rule proposed or adopted by the agency until the effective date of the rule as provided in this section. Nothing in this subsection prohibits an agency from enforcing an established policy or practice of the agency that existed prior to the proposal or adoption of the rule as long as the policy or practice is within the scope of the agency's lawful authority.

2-4-406. Committee objection to violation of authority for rule -- effect. (1) If the appropriate administrative rule review committee objects to all or some portion of a proposed or adopted rule because the committee considers it not to have been proposed or adopted in substantial compliance with 2-4-302, 2-4-303, and 2-4-305, the committee shall send a written objection to the agency that promulgated the rule. The objection must contain a concise statement of the committee's reasons for its action.

(2) Within 14 days after the mailing of a committee objection to a rule, the agency promulgating the rule shall respond in writing to the committee. After receipt of the response, the committee may withdraw or modify its objection.

(3) If the committee fails to withdraw or substantially modify its objection to a rule, it may vote to send the objection to the secretary of state, who shall, upon receipt of the objection, publish the objection in the register adjacent to any notice of adoption of the rule and in the ARM adjacent to the rule, provided an agency response must also be published if requested by the agency. Costs of publication of the objection and the agency response must be paid by the committee.

(4) If an objection to all or a portion of a rule has been published pursuant to subsection (3), the agency bears the burden, in any action challenging the legality of the rule or portion of a rule objected to

by the committee, of proving that the rule or portion of the rule objected to was adopted in substantial compliance with 2-4-302, 2-4-303, and 2-4-305. If a rule is invalidated by court judgment because the agency failed to meet its burden of proof imposed by this subsection and the court finds that the rule was adopted in arbitrary and capricious disregard for the purposes of the authorizing statute, the court may award costs and reasonable attorney fees against the agency.